

CONTRASTIVE ANALYSIS BETWEEN ENGLISH AND INDONESIAN NOUN PHRASE

Budi Susatyo¹, Dholiful Hadi², Syahril Roziqi³

Universitas PGRI Ronggolawe Tuban

e-mail: 1mrbudicobusat@gmail.com, 2hadialluring@gmail.com

Abstract

The main goal of this research is intended to find the differences and similarities between English and Indonesian noun phrases. The problem to study is to know the patterns of English and Indonesian Noun Phrases. However, it will be detected the similarities and differences between the two languages. The patterns of English and Indonesian Noun Phrases are analyzed by using combination English and Indonesian Noun Phrases.

The data, the writer uses contrastive analysis method to determine their similarities and differences; the source of the research; understanding English grammar, vocabulary, basic English usage, introduction to linguistic; and Tata Bahasa Praktis Bahasa Indonesia and syntaxes all data collected above are analyzed by contrastive analysis.

The result of the data analysis reveals that there are differences between English and Indonesian Noun Phrases; namely; adjective as modifier; possessive adjective or possessive noun as modifier; participate as modifier, noun as modifier and adverb as modifier. Meanwhile, there are three kinds of similarities that is 1) the similarities of Head-Modifier; the similarities of Modifier-Head and the similarities of Modifier-Head-Modifier, 2) the similarities element forming noun phrases, namely prepositional phrases, adverbs, numerals, noun, demonstrative adjective, indefinite adjective and non-finite clause, 3) the similarities in order of element forming noun phrases; namely the order of determiner and the order of modifier. By knowing the differences and the similarities above; it is expected that the teacher can explain the noun phrases both English and Indonesian well.

Keyword : contrastive analysis, noun phrase

INTRODUCTION

There are many problems in learning language such as non linguistic and linguistic. Non linguistic problem is motivation, environment, and culture. Linguistic problem is syntax and semantic. The nature and the description of the problem depend on the comparison of the two language structures and habit system.

On the source language interferes with the acquisition of the target language. To avoid the difficulties in learning the target language, it is necessary to know the similarities and the differences between the source language and the target language.

One of the difficulties in learning target language in Noun Phrase pattern. It is reason why the contrastive Analysis between English and Indonesian Noun Phrase must be presented. Indonesian learners still get difficulties in constructing English Noun Phrase and it is important to know the rules of writing Noun Phrase especially in English.

Contrastive analysis is a procedure that is comparing the structure of the native and foreign language, predicting the difficulties and the errors in learning process, arranging the teaching material and also preparing the method in giving the subjects to the learners. Henry Guntur Tarigan (1988: 23) states that “Analisis perbedaan adalah kegiatan yang mencoba membandingkan struktur 1 an B₂ untuk mengidentifikasi perbedaan-perbedaan diantara kedua bahasa”.

From the definition above, it can be stated that the different analysis compares two things concerning with linguistic points. To support the statement, the writer would like to give definition about the different analysis according to Sri Hartuti (1989:45) as “cabang ilmu yang membandingkan dua bahasa dari segala komponennya secara sinkronik sehingga ditemukan perbedaan dan kemiripan-kemiripan yang ada”.

According to Sri Hastuti (189:23) the contrastive analysis can be used too help the teaching in learning instruction, to help overcoming learner’s difficulties in learning process on the target language to discover easily the difficulties faced by the learners to obtain the regular learning to be used as follow up to classify the error easily.

Phrases are group of words that operate as a single structure but not normally as free utterances that initiate conversation. Phrase is enlarged by modifications structures in which one word functions as head and others as modifiers. Ramlan (1981:136) states further that phrases has two kinds, namely exocentric and endocentric.

According to George Wishon and Burks (1980:56) English Noun Phrase is also called endocentric phrase and at least contains of two components, head and modifier. Head is the most element in English Noun Phrase. This head has same distribution with the phrase which is formed. It can be stated that Head in English Noun Phrase can be

adjective participle, noun, adverbial, prepositional phrase, infinitive, and function word (include determiner).

From the explanation above, it is clear that to compose English Noun Phrase we can not release from head and modifier. So we must pay attention to the rules or pattern of English Noun Phrase. To make clear, here the writer would like to present the pattern of English Noun Phrase state by Ronal Wardhaugh (1985:41).

The writer would like to try to compare the structure of Indonesia as the source language and the structure of English as the target language to identify the differences and the similarities. In this article the writer would like to clarify the similarities and differences between English and Indonesian noun phrases.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The design of this research was qualitative descriptive with the specification on library research. It refers to the general strategy followed in gathering and analyzing the data necessary for answering the question at hand. The data are analyzed in the form of phenomena description not numerical or cause and effect relationship. This research yields description of the data analyzed to find the similarities and the differences between English and Indonesian Noun Phrase.

To collect the data the writer uses library research, its way of obtaining data from books especially those which are relevant to the research. In this research the writer collects the data from English books and Indonesian books containing study of English and Indonesian Noun Phrase. The research compares English and Indonesian Noun phrase. So the writer takes some sentences consisting of Noun Phrase quoted from books related with this study both English and Indonesian as the object of the research. They are "A University Grammar of English by Randolph Quirk and Sidney Greenbaum, Understanding English Grammar, A Linguistic Approach by Ronald Wardaugh, Vocab by Rahmadi Sabroni, Basic English Usage by Michael Swan, introduction to Linguistics by Ramlan, Tata Bahasa Praktis Bahasa Indonesia by Abdul Chaer and Sintaksis by Ramlan, Let's Write English by George E. Wishon.

The writer uses three technique of collecting data, comparative, deductive and inductive.

A. Comparative

A comparison of the language can be carried out by using only of several different models. This emphasized the importance of detailed “Scientific Description” of language based on a description of the different categories that make up the pattern of a language. These categories where defines informal form and they were established inductively.

B. Deductive

In the deductive technique, Best (1981: 4) state that deductive process of moving from the general observation to the specific. In this case, the writer takes decision which departs from the general fact to the specific fact. Based on this technique the writer collects the data related to this study from some literatures or books, that is the examples of Noun Phrases then concludes them specifically.

C. Inductive

Best (1981: 6) states that inductive technique is the process of moving from specific observation to general. In this research, the writer takes decision which departs from the specific fact to general fact by using certain logical principle.

The writer collects the data related to that research from some books that is the examples of the noun phrase and concludes them generally. The data obtained analyzed by using syntactical theory suggested by some English and Indonesian linguistic. In this processing English and Indonesian Noun Phrase are analyzed and classified on the basic of the kinds of structure of Noun Phrase

RESULTS

This chapter describes presenting of the data, the description of the data and the data analysis.

- English Noun Phrase

English Noun Phrase is also called endocentric phrase and at least contains of two components, head and modifier. Head is the most element in English Noun Phrase. This head has some distribution with the phrase which is formed. It can be known that head in English Noun Phrase is always noun. Modification in English Noun Phrase can be adjective, noun, adverbial, participle, preposition phrase, function word (determiner) and infinitive (Ronald Wardaugh, 1985: 45).

After analyzing all data, the writer will find out the similarities and the differences of the pre modifier and post modifier of English and Indonesian Noun Phrases as follows:

1. The similarities in the order of determiner and in the order of modifier in English and Indonesian Noun Phrases.

a. The Pre Modifier

The system of the pre modifier of the Indonesian Noun Phrase is similar to that the English Noun Phrase which expresses a quantity will be structured in the same way as that of the Indonesian one. So, the adjective indefinite quantities of both types of the noun phrase are pre modifier. The following table will clarify those similarities.

Determiner - Items	Headword	Determiner - Item	Headword
Sedikit	Waktu	a little	time
beberapa	tempat	a few	places
semua	lagu	all	songs

b. The Post Modifier

1. Prepositional Phrase

Indonesian prepositional phrases modifying the nouns are more or less similar to the English ones.

Notice the table below:

Headwords		Prepositional Phrase	Meaning in English
Indonesian	Beras Kiriman	dari Jogja untuk Ibu tentang Geografi	Rice from Jogja The shipment from mother
	Buku	menuju Solo	Book about geography
	Bus	di samping masjid	Bus to Solo The house beside the mosque
	Rumah		

Headwords English	Prepositional Phrase
Writer	in the U. S.
Book	of poems
Tea	without milk
Picture	on the wall

The above examples indicate that both Indonesian and English prepositional phrases have the same distribution as post modifier of the headwords.

c. Adverb and Adverbials

Most adjective and English adverbs or adverbials are post modifier. Notice the following comparison:

Indonesian	English
Pemandangan di luar	The view outside
Kamar-kamar di lantai atas	The rooms upstairs
Pertanyaan-pertanyaan sekarang	The questions now
Tahun sebelumnya	The year before

It is clear that the English adverbs ‘outside’, ‘upstairs’, ‘before’, have the same position as the Indonesian ones ‘di luar’, ‘di lantai atas’, ‘sebelumnya’. They are all post modifiers.

d. Adjective

Most adjectives of Indonesian function as post modifier in the noun phrases. The adjectives of English on the contrary, end to be modifier in the noun phrases.

In Indonesian phrase: ‘baju baru’, the word ‘baru’ which is an adjective follows the headword ‘baju’. While in English equivalent ‘new shirt’, the adjective ‘new’ never follows clearly the position of the adjective in Indonesian and the English noun phrases.

Indonesian	English
Lelaki yang bijaksana	A wise man
Rumah indah	A beautiful house
Anak yang nakal	A naughty boy
Mobil merah	A red car

A part from the tendency of the adjectives of English to precede the headword, there are some adjectives case like this, the distribution of adjective would be similar to the Indonesian adjectives.

Example:

The stars visible.

The students brave enough to attempt the English course.

The boys easiest to teach.

The adjective ‘visible’, ‘brave enough to attempt the course’, ‘easiest to teach’, follow the headwords ‘stars’, ‘students’, ‘boys’ respectively, in

those English phrases, the adjective would be expressed in the same position as the Indonesian ones. They are placed as post modifiers.

Example:

Bintang-bintang yang tampak.

Para siswa yang cukup berani mencoba kursus bahasa Inggris itu.

Anak-anak yang paling mudah untuk belajar.

Nouns or noun phrases

Indonesian nouns or noun phrases the headwords as post modifier are considered to be appositions. Noun or noun phrase as apposition has the same distribution as the English one. Observe the following comparison:

English : - Mr. Wilson, a prominent lawyer,

- Mr. Soesilo, president,

Indonesian: - Tuan Wilson, seorang pengacara terkenal

- Tuan Soesilo, presiden,

The Indonesian noun or noun phrases presiden, seorang pengacara terkenal, are appositions. The English noun or noun phrases president, a prominent lawyer are appositions too.

e. Numerals

The Indonesian numerals are used for identifying or naming. The English numerals are used for identifying or naming. Note the following comparison:

Indonesian	English
Elizabeth kedua	Elizabeth the second
Henry kedelapan	Henry the eighth
Volume satu	Volume one
Halaman lima puluh	Page fifty

English numerals 'the second', 'the eighth', 'one', 'fifty' are used for identifying or naming. These numerals are in the same position as the Indonesian one 'kedua', 'kedelapan', 'satu', and 'lima puluh'.

2. The differences in the order of determiner and in the order of modifier in English and Indonesian Noun Phrases.

a. The pre modifier

In the Indonesian noun phrase, there is no concord between the determiner items and headword, for instance: 'satu tas', 'lima tas', 'banyak tas'. In the English noun phrase, on the contrary, there is a concord between the determiner-items and headwords. Some determiner-items must be used to write countable nouns, some with uncountable nouns; and some other with either countable or

uncountable nouns. The English 'many' for instance, can not be used with singular countable nouns, but with plural countable nouns. For example: 'many table' (wrong), 'many tables' (correct), except for quantifiers of determiner-items and cardinal numbers of ordinal items; the English pre modifier determiner-items, and ordinal items will not be found out as pre modifiers in Indonesian noun phrases. Indonesian determiner and ordinal-items tend to follow the headword. The table below shows the different position of determiner and ordinal-items in Indonesian and English Noun Phrases:

	Indonesian	English
Determiner - Items	Meja anda Buku John Tempat ini Binatang-binatang itu	Your table John's book This place Those animals
Ordinal - Items	Surat pertama Hotel terbesar Kamar yang bersih Model yang paling cocok Bus yang sangat bersih	The first letter The biggest hotel Clean room The most suitable model Very clean bus

b. The post modifier

1. Verbal phrase

Verbal phrase can be post modifier in Indonesian, the kinds of verbal phrases as post modifiers will not be found out in English. These types of Indonesian verbal phrases are equivalent to the English infinitive phrases.

Indonesian		English	
Headword	Verbal Phrases	Headword	Infinitive Phrases
Keputusan (nya)	pindah ke Solo	(his)	to move to Solo
Usaha (nya)	melarikan diri	decision	to escape
Permohonan (nya)	mengundurkan diri	(his)	to resign
		attempt	
		(his) request	

2. Demonstrative Pronouns

Indonesian demonstrative pronouns follow the headwords of the noun phrases. They are called post modifiers. English possessive precede the headword of the noun phrases and they are called pre modifiers.

Example:

Indonesian	English
Rumah saya	My house
Mobil-mobil mereka	Their cars
Anaknya	His child
Sepatu anda	Your shoes

After analyzing all the data, the writer finds out the similarities and the differences between English and Indonesian noun phrases as follows:

1. The Similarities
 - a. The similarities of English and Indonesian noun phrases
 - 1) Noun Phrase which states numeral of cardinal number

English		Indonesian	
Head	Modifier	Head	Modifier
number	one	nomor	satu
number	two	nomor	dua
number	three	nomor	tiga

- 2) Noun Phrase which the modifier is adverb and specific adjective

English		Indonesian	
Head	Modifier	Head	Modifier
People	here	Orang-orang	di sini
Indonesia	now	Indonesia	masa sekarang
Example	below	Contoh	di bawah ini
Girl	in blue	Gadis	berbaju biru
Something	useful	Sesuatu	yang
Boy	is like Budi	Laki-laki	bermanfaat seperti Budi

- 3) Noun Phrase which the modifier is prepositional phrase

English		Indonesian	
Head	Modifier	Head	Modifier
Meaning	of a sentence	Makna	dari kalimat
Road	to Lincoln	Jalan	ke Lincoln
Theme	of story	Tema	dari cerita
Girl	in the corner	Gadis	di pojok itu

4) Noun phrase which the modifier is noun finite clause

English		Indonesian	
Head	Modifier	Head	Modifier
Child	playing doll	Anak	yang bermain boneka
Boy	sitting there	Lelaki	yang duduk di sana

b. The differences of English and Indonesian noun Phrase

1) Non Phrase which states numeral of cardinal number

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Modifier	Head
A	book	sebuah	buku
a	camel	seekor	onta
an	hour	satu	jam
an	orange	sebuah	jeruk
a	word	sepatuh	kata

2) Noun phrase which modifies is cardinal number

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Modifier	Head
Two	winner	Dua	pemenang
Three	trees	Tiga	pohon
Four	mangoes	Empat	mangga

3) Noun Phrase which the M is indefinite adjective

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Modifier	Head
All	people	Semua	orang
most	people	kebanyakan	orang
each	one	tiap-tiap	orang
no	sugar	tidak ada	gula
No	butter	Tanpa	mentega
much	money	banyak	uang

several	days	beberapa	hari
---------	------	----------	------

2. The differences between English and Indonesian Noun Phrase

The writer can describe the differences between English and Indonesian noun phrase, the H-M arrangement is more prevailing than the other ways arrangement of M and H in the two languages can be illustrated as follows:

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Modifier	Head
Garden	gate	Pintu	kebun
fresh	air	udara	segar
my	book	buku	saya
red	bag	tas	merah
clever	student	siswa	pandai
second	child	anak	kedua

The writer will give more identification on the differences of both languages below:

Adjective as modifier

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Head	Modifier
beautiful	girl	Gadis	cantik
fresh	air	udara	segar
boring	day	hari	yang
old	man	lelaki	membosankan
expensive	house	rumah	tua
interesting	film	film	mahal yang menarik

a. Demonstrative Adjective as Modifier

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Head	Modifier
Those	houses	rumah-	itu
these	people	rumah	ini
that	table	orang-	itu
this	bag	orang	ini
		meja	
		tas	

b. Ordinal Number as Modifier

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Head	Modifier
First	lesson	Pelajaran	pertama
second	mistake	kesalahan	ke-dua
sixth	month	bulan	ke-enam

c. Possessive adjective or possessive noun as modifier

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Head	Modifier
My	room	Kamar	saya
our	company	perusahaan	kami
their	brother	saudara	mereka
Sisca's	dress	gaun	Sisca

d. Noun as modifier

English		Indonesian	
Modifier	Head	Head	Modifier
Stone	wall	Dinding	batu
garden	gate	pintu	kebun
gold	medal	medali	emas
pop	singer	penyanyi	pop

CONCLUSION

There are similarities and differences both English and Indonesian. The differences will cause interference learning target language and the similarities will facilitate it. After analyzing the data of the research by using contrastive analysis, the writer finds similarities and differences in Noun Phrases between English and Indonesian as follows:

I. The similarities between English and Indonesian Noun Phrase.

1. The similarities in H-M patterns of Indonesian and English Noun

Phrases, they are:

a. Modifier + Head (M+H)

Example: - all people

- semua orang

b. Head + Modifier (H+M)

Example: - Bus to Solo

- bus ke Solo

c. Modifier + Head + Modifier (M+H+M)

Example: - a dozen of new shirt

- selusin baju baru

2. The similarities in elements forming Indonesian and English Noun Phrases, they are:

a. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of prepositional phrases.

Example: English : the road to Solo

Indonesian : bus ke Solo

b. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of adverb.

Example: English : the news today

Indonesian : berita hari ini

c. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of numeral.

Example: English : seven houses

d. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of noun

Example: English : gold medal

Indonesian : medali emas

e. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of indefinite adjective

Example: English : each one

Indonesian : tiap-tiap orang

f. The element forming Noun Phrases consisting of non-finite clause.

Example: English : the girl sitting there

Indonesian : gadis yang duduk disana

3. The similarities in the order of determiner and in the order of modifier in English and Indonesian Noun Phrases.

a. The Pre Modifier

The position of qualifiers determiner-items and ordinal number of cardinal-items.

Examples:

English		Indonesian	
Determiner - Items	Headword	Determiner -Item	Headword
a little	Time	sedikit	waktu

b. The Post Modifier

(a) Prepositional Phrases

Indonesian prepositional phrases modifying the noun are more or less similar to the English ones.

Examples:

Headwords in Indonesia	Prepositional Phrase
Beras	dari Surabaya
Kiriman	dari Ibu

Headwords in English	Prepositional Phrase
Writer	in the U. S.
Book	of poems

(b) Adverbs and Adverbials

Adjective and English adverbs or adverbials are post modifiers. Notice the following comparison:

Indonesian	English
Pemandangan di luar	The view outside
Kamar-kamar di lantai atas	The rooms upstairs

(c) Adjectives

Most adjectives of Indonesian function as placed after modifiers in the noun phrase. The adjective of English on the contrary, tend to be pre modifiers in the noun phrases.

In Indonesian phrases 'baju baru', the word 'baru' which is an adjective follows head word 'baju'. While in English equipment 'new shirt', the

adjective 'new' never follows clearly the position of the adjective in the Indonesian and the English noun phrases.

Indonesian	English
Lelaki yang bijaksana	A wise man
Rumah indah	A beautiful house

(d) Noun or Noun Phrase

Indonesian noun or noun phrases following the head word as post modifier are considered to be appositions. Noun or Noun Phrases as apposition has the same distribution as the English one. Observe the following comparison:

English : - Mr. Wilson, a prominent lawyer,
 - Mr. Soesilo, president,

Indonesian: - Tuan Wilson, seorang pengacara terkenal
 - Tuan Soesilo, presiden,

(e) Numerals

The Indonesian numerals are used for identifying or naming. The English numerals are used for identifying or naming. Note the following comparison:

Indonesian	English
Elizabeth kedua	Elizabeth the Second
Henry kedelapan	Henry the Eighth

II. The differences in the order of determiner and in the order of modifier in English and Indonesian Noun Phrases

1. The Modifier

- a. In Indonesian Noun Phrases, there is no concord between the determiner – items and the headword but in English there is concord.
- b. In English, the position of determiner – items are before the headword but in Indonesian after the headword.

Example:

	Indonesian	English
Determiner - Items	Meja anda	Your table
	Buku John	John's book
Ordinal - Items	Surat pertama	The first letter
	Hotel terbesar	The biggest hotel

2. Test Post Modifier

- a. In Indonesian, post modifier can be verbal phrase but in English can be infinitive phrase.

Example:

Indonesian		English	
Headword	Verbal Phrases	Headword	Infinitive Phrases
Keputusan (nya)	pindah ke Solo	(his) decision	to move to Solo

- b. In Indonesian, post modifier can be demonstrative pronoun but in English can be possessive pronoun.

Example:

Indonesian	English
Rumah saya	My house
Sepatu anda	Your shoes

- 1) The similarities of English and Indonesian noun phrases, can be:
 - a) Noun phrase which states numeral of cardinal number.
 - b) Noun phrase which the modifier is adverb and specific adjective.
 - c) Noun phrase which the modifier is prepositional phrase
 - d) Noun phrase which modifier is non infinite clause.
- 2) The differences of English and Indonesian noun phrases, can:
 - a) Noun phrase which states of cardinal number.
 - b) Noun phrase which the modifier is cardinal number.
 - c) Noun phrase which the modifier is indefinite adjective.

3. The differences between English and Indonesian noun phrases
 - a. Adjective as modifier
 - b. Demonstrative adjective as modifier
 - c. Ordinal number as modifier
 - d. Possessive adjective or possessive noun as modifier
 - e. Noun as modifier

REFERENCES

- Alwasilah, Chaedar. 1983. *Pengantar Linguistik Bandung*. Bandung: N.V Ganeka .
- Blomfield, Leonard. 1933. *Language*. New York: Henry Holt and Co.
- Chaer, Abdul. 1991. *Linguistik Umum*. Bandung: Eresca.
- Hastuti, Sri, PH. 1974. *Mari Berbahasa Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Swadaya.
- Lado, Robert. 1964. *Teaching English a Scientific Approach*. Toronto: MC Grow. Hill. Inc
- Parera, JD. 1991. *Sintaksis*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Tama.
- Parera, Jos Daniel. 1986. *Linguistik Edukasional*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Quirk, Randolf. 1998. *Dictionary of Contemporary English*. London: Clars Ltd
- Ramlan, M. 1981. *Ilmu Bahasa Indonesia: Sintaksis*. Yogyakarta: CV. Karyono.
- Ramlan, M. 1985. *Morfologi Suatu Tinjauan Deskriptif*. Yogyakarta: CV. Karyono.
- Ramlan, M. 1978. *Penyusunan Tata Bahasa Struktur Bahasa Indonesia*. Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Dep. P&K.
- Richards, Jack C. and Theodore S. Rodgers. 1992. *Approaches and Methods in Language Teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tarigan, Henry Guntur. 1988. *Pengajaran Analisis Kesalahan Bahasa*. Bandung: Angkasa.
- Wishon, George E & Julia M. Burks. 1980. *Let's Write English*. Litton Education Publishing International. New York: USA.